

MINUTES OF A REGULAR MEETING OF COUNCIL

CITY OF GARFIELD HEIGHTS, OHIO

Monday, July 13, 2020

(Note: This meeting was conducted by teleconference due to the current Covid-19 outbreak.)

MEETING CALLED TO ORDER AT 7:00 p.m. by Council President Matt Burke.

ROLL CALL: **PRESENT:** Council Members Dudley, Donahue, Nenadovich, Davis, Blake, Burke, Vaughn

READING AND DISPOSAL OF MINUTES:

PRESIDENT BURKE: Reading and Disposal of Minutes for Monday, June 22, 2020. I'd like to make a motion that we accept the Minutes as written. Do I have a second?

CLMN DONAHUE: Second.

PRESIDENT BURKE: On the motion made to accept the Minutes of the Regular Meeting of Council for Monday, June 22, 2020, seconded by Clmn Donahue, Barb, could you please take a roll call vote beginning with Clmn Burke.

AYES: Burke, Vaughn, Dudley, Donahue, Nenadovich, Davis, Blake

Excuse me, Sir; can you please mute your phone? All Members of Council please hit star 6. Can everybody hear me? *(Council replied Yes.)* If I can have all the Council people, the Mayor and everybody that is on this call to dial star 6 please. Can you hear me? Barb, at this time, could you take another roll call?

AYES: Burke, Vaughn, Dudley, Donahue, Nenadovich, Davis, Blake

We have everybody. Thank you so much for that. I did not want to have to do that but apparently I had to.

Let's move on to Legislative Committee Minutes from Thursday, July 2, 2020. Mr. Nenadovich.

CLMN NENADOVICH: Mr. Chairman. I would like to make a motion to accept the Legislative Minutes for Thursday, July 2, 2020 as written.

PRESIDENT BURKE: I would like to second that motion. On the motion made by Clmn Nenadovich and seconded by Clmn Burke to accept the Legislative Committee Meeting Minutes for Thursday, July 2, 2020, Barb, could you please take a roll call vote beginning with Clmn Nenadovich.

AYES: Nenadovich, Davis, Blake, Burke, Vaughn, Dudley, Donahue

The Legislative Committee Minutes pass with 7 Yes votes.

Barb, could you give me a refresher. What happened with the Regular Meeting Minutes of Council? Did we all vote on that? We were able to?

CLERK: Yes, we voted twice and there were 7 Yes.

PRESIDENT BURKE: So the Minutes of the Regular Meeting are 7 Yes votes?

CLERK: Yes, you made the motion and Mr. Donahue made the second.

PRESIDENT BURKE: Thank you. With all the commotion that was going on, I couldn't hear.

CLERK: Yes, I know.

COMMITTEE REPORTS:

PRESIDENT BURKE: Committee Reports. Do we have any Committee Reports? There are none. We will move on to the reports of the Mayor and the Directors.

REPORTS OF THE MAYOR AND DIRECTORS:

PRESIDENT BURKE: I have unmuted everybody. Mayor Collova, are you there?

MAYOR VIC COLLOVA: Yes, Mr. Chairman, I am and I do have a report.

PRESIDENT BURKE: You have the floor.

MAYOR VIC COLLOVA: Thank you, Mr. Chairman. The first thing I want to talk about is the Cuyahoga County Rent Relief Program. I will read the notice that we received:

"Cuyahoga County residents who have lost income due to Covid-19 and need help paying their rent can now call 1-833-377-7368. You can also apply for assistance on-line at www.neorenthelp.org. This is a grant—not a loan—with up to three months of rent paid for those who qualify on a household income and need."

There is an attached flyer. They should look up the Website to look at this program. This could be a huge help for our residents. Council, if you can, please pass it around to your residents because this certainly can be a big help to them. Three months of free rent if they qualify.

The next thing I want to talk about is street resurfacing. We talked about it a little bit at the Caucus Meeting, but I want to let everyone know some of the streets that we have agreed to do. We are looking at doing the chip seal streets. We are looking at doing:

- Christine from East 131st Street
- East 139th
- All of Parkview
- East 84th
- Reed to the dead end
- McCracken

- ▣ East 88th to East 94th
- ▣ Andover
- ▣ Valley View to the cul de sac
- ▣ Chester (the concrete section only)
- ▣ Fairlawn from Turney to Bangor
- ▣ Fruitside from Hathaway to Meadowbrook.

That is the resurfacing program that the city is investing in.

This is what the Water Department is doing. We have:

- ▣ East 109th from Langton to Edgepark
- ▣ Grannis Road, Turney to East 135th
- ▣ Southpark Way from East 131st to East 139th
- ▣ Garfield Drive, Turney to East 104th
- ▣ Wolf Street, East 135th to East Terminus
- ▣ East 88th Street
- ▣ Grand Division to Birchwood
- ▣ Park Heights, Turney to East 113th
- ▣ Monica Lane, Thraves to Rockside
- ▣ Valley Lane to East 128th and East 133rd.
- ▣ As you know, we're working on Broadway and East 135th. That will be completed in the near future.

That's quite a few streets with a lot of dollars. There's certainly people that are still not going to be happy because your streets are not being touched this year, but we will try to continue this program each year until we catch up. So I wanted to make sure everybody and all the Council is aware of that.

Next, I want to say to everyone, I receive calls and e-mails regarding whether or not the schools should open this year. I want everybody to understand that, as the city leaders we have no say-so whatsoever in the school operation. They are a separate entity that is run by the School Board, that does a very good job, but if people are worried about the school and have any questions about the school, they need to contact the school directly. There is really nothing I can do whatsoever. I wanted to get that out.

Next, our Service Department will have another paper shred day Saturday, July 25, 2020, from 9:00 a.m. – 12:00 noon. The drop off site is at our Service Department Garage, 13600 McCracken Road.

The next business I have is, folks, 4th of July was about two weeks ago. It is now July 13th. Let's stop with the fireworks. We've given out several tickets. People still think it's the 4th of July. You know you can have a little flexibility because people have always for six centuries celebrated the 4th of July with fireworks, but it's July 13th and they're still firing them off. The police are still going to give those tickets, so please let's cut it off.

The next thing I wanted to say was every day our Service guys patch our streets, work on sewers, cut grass, maintain our buildings, plus many other duties. So recently, they had to pick

up litter thrown all over the streets. I notice this is being done for the most part by young kids. Parents, please, every time we clean up the city the very next day or two/three days later it's bad again. Please, tell your kids to keep that garbage, bring it home, throw it in a receptacle, something. We can't continue instead of patching streets we're picking up McDonald's bags, etc. throughout the city. So please, I encourage all parents to try to get our kids to do the right thing because it's getting tough.

With that, I'm going to move on to tonight's legislation. Ordinance 58. We are showing our support for Cleveland Clinic with the 480/Granger Road Interchange Project. If this comes to fruition this will be a great win-win for the city, for the hospital and it will bring business, more doctors in, probably expansion of the hospital. There's many things that can come from this. So we're really looking forward to this. I urge Council's approval of this. Ordinance 60-2020 is to allow for the Covid financial situation that we're in. Any questions on that, Barb can address that. Ordinance 61. This is in regards to a lot split to be in compliance with BUSTR our old service garage land. Ordinance 62 allows us to bid for the Orchard Slope Repair Project. This project is long overdue and it's at no cost to the city. We appreciate the County's efforts in helping us with this one. Ordinance 63 allows our Engineers to prepare plans for the Granger Road water project on Granger Hill. Everybody knows about that. I've lived in this city a long time and it's always been a problem on Granger Road Hill. For some reason it gets worse. We're trying to get this thing corrected prior to winter. So we could get this approved so we can get that work accomplished. Ordinance 64. The ordinance authorizes us to enter into agreement with Teletronics Inc. for the purpose of upgrading a database for back up and disaster recovery storage. Our IT fellow, Bruce, gave me something to read to give you a little understanding of what's happening.

"The city currently has back up appliances at city hall and the Police Department, but it is aging and will eventually create compatibility issues in the city's network environment. It also does not address business continuance and give the city a quick disaster recovery situation. As a municipality, we must address both of these scenarios. This is the third step of the city's upgrade of service and disaster recovery. Datto's state of the art technology and infrastructure can protect us from down time. It will protect our critical information from accidental deletions. It backs up, protects and allows us to instantly restore accounts and data so we could return our normal operations quickly. It will virtualize the services remotely and maintain an off-site and secure cloud within seconds."

That means that things can continue to operate as usual and we will have the time and resources to fix server issues without compromising any data and incurring any further downtime. We've had some issues this year. We don't want to have to repeat those issues. I urge Council to vote forward with this ordinance.

Resolution 17-2020. Tax budget. Once again, Barb is available to answer any questions on the budget. Resolution 18 allows us to apply for a Diesel Mitigation Trust Fund Grant for our diesel fleet, which would help us immensely.

With that, Mr. Chairman, you have my report.

PRESIDENT BURKE: Thank you, Mayor Collova. Starting with Ward 1. Mr. Dudley, do you have any questions for the Mayor on his report this evening?

CLMN DUDLEY: No, no questions for the Mayor, Mr. Chairman.

PRESIDENT BURKE: Thank you, Mr. Dudley. Mr. Donahue, do you have any questions for the Mayor on his report this evening?

CLMN DONAHUE: No, Sir. I do not have any questions.

PRESIDENT BURKE: Thank you, Mr. Donahue. Ms. Davis, do you have any questions for the Mayor on his report?

CLWN DAVIS: I do, Mr. Chairman. Do you want me to wait? You can go back to 3. I can wait.

PRESIDENT BURKE: OK. I forgot Mr. Nenadovich. I apologize, Mr. Nenadovich. Do you have any questions for the Mayor, Mr. Nenadovich?

CLMN NENADOVICH: No, Mr. Burke, I do not.

PRESIDENT BURKE: Thank you. I'm sorry. Ms. Davis, you have the floor.

CLWN DAVIS: Thank you, Mr. Chairman. Mayor Collova, you mentioned McCracken starting at East 88th and where does it end? The street repair?

MAYOR VIC COLLOVA: One second. I'll get you that. McCracken from East 88th to East 94th.

CLWN DAVIS: OK. That's great. You know how I spoke to you previously about Elmwood? That street is horrible, Mayor Collova. I did not hear you mention Elmwood. Is there any way we could slide Elmwood in there?

MAYOR VIC COLLOVA: If we could find the money we could slide them all in there. Right now we are at our budget--\$700,000.00. There's a lot of streets. Believe me, there's a lot of streets. Every Councilperson could say I need more streets done. There happens to be a street called Evelyn, which the Mayor lives on, that we would love to see done too. But I know the reaction if I had that street done and the other ones weren't so mine is just as bad as Elmwood and everybody else's. We can only work with the money we have. I do understand that there's some really bad streets out there. We will try once again and hopefully next year they will make the list.

CLWN DAVIS: OK. Thank you, Mayor Collova

MAYOR VIC COLLOVA: You're welcome.

PRESIDENT BURKE: Mr. Blake, do you have any questions for the Mayor on his report?

CLMN BLAKE: No questions, Mr. Chairman.

PRESIDENT BURKE: Thank you. I, too, do not have any questions for the Mayor. Mr. Vaughn, do you have any questions for the Mayor on his report?

CLMN VAUGHN: Mr. Chairman, I have no questions. Thank you.

PRESIDENT BURKE: Thank you, Mr. Vaughn. Let's move on to our Communications from Citizens on Tonight's Agenda. These are comments specific to tonight's agenda—the Ordinances and Resolutions. Would the Clerk please read the rules.

COMMENTS BY CITIZENS ON THE AGENDA:

CLERK: Comments shall be strictly limited to brief statements not to exceed five minutes with comments limited to legislation on the current evening's agenda. No citizen shall speak more than once.

PRESIDENT BURKE: Are there any citizens on the line that would like to comment specifically on tonight's ordinances and resolutions?

Ronda Crayton. Could you please give me some clarification on Ordinance 62 and 61? Specifically what those are?

PRESIDENT BURKE: Is our City Engineer on the line?

CITY ENGINEER DAVID KROCK: Yes, I am, Mr. Burke.

PRESIDENT BURKE: Could you clarify Ordinances 61 and 62? 61 had to deal with these lot splits.

CITY ENGINEER DAVID KROCK: Certainly.

MS. CRAYTON: Do you have the parcel number for those?

CITY ENGINEER DAVID KROCK: Yes, Ms. Crayton, the parcel number looks like 546-07-013.

MS. CRAYTON: What's the other? That's the one parcel that's going to be split. Can you tell me what that's going to be used for?

CITY ENGINEER DAVID KROCK: Mr. Burke, would you like me to refer?

PRESIDENT BURKE: Yes.

CITY ENGINEER DAVID KROCK: Thank you. The lot split is for the purposes of. We have an old service garage at this location and there were some underground storage tanks. BUSTR is the State agency that is asking us to split the lot so that some of the contaminated land is no longer built upon. This is contaminated underground—not on the surface. So we will be splitting

the lot to designate what land could be built on and what land cannot be built on in the future. Nothing is planned at this time to be built on either parcel.

MS. CRAYTON: That was on Orchard?

CITY ENGINEER DAVID KROCK: That is Ordinance 61.

PRESIDENT BURKE: That is on East 131st Street.

MS. CRAYTON: OK. The old service garage on 131st. What is number 62 on Orchard?

CITY ENGINEER DAVID KROCK: Ordinance 62 on Orchard is a grant that the city received from the County. This is to make certain repairs alongside of a home there relative to erosion from a nearby stream. So the County has given the city a grant to fix that problem. So that's allowing the project to move forward.

MS. CRAYTON: OK. So where is that located?

CITY ENGINEER DAVID KROCK: It's an address. 4909 Orchard. It's right next to the creek there.

MS. CRAYTON: OK. Thank you very much.

CLERK: Mr. Chairman, could Ms. Crayton please give us her address?

PRESIDENT BURKE: Yes. Ms. Crayton, could you please give us your address?

MS. CRAYTON: 4643 Osborn Road.

PRESIDENT BURKE: Thank you.

MS. CRAYTON: You're welcome.

PRESIDENT BURKE: OK. Are there any other citizens wishing to make a comment on tonight's ordinances and resolutions?

Stacey Collier, 13500 Cranwood Park Blvd., I have a question about Ordinance 61. After you split that parcel, before any building of that property that you use for building, would there be a special meeting if you're going to sell that parcel or build on that parcel prior to you doing so?

PRESIDENT BURKE: Mr. Krock, do you want to answer that or does Mayor Collova want to answer that?

CITY ENGINEER DAVID KROCK: Yes, I can answer or the Mayor. The answer is that anything will be built on that parcel would go through the city's normal approval process. So if it was something that would need to go to Planning Commission it would be noted publicly.

MS. COLLIER: Thank you.

PRESIDENT BURKE: Thank you, Ms. Collier. Now we can go into tonight's Resolutions and Ordinances. I would also like to remind everybody to please mute your phones. Seems like we're getting a lot of background noise. I think it's inappropriate. I really would ask you politely to please mute your phones.

ORDINANCES AND RESOLUTIONS:

PRESIDENT BURKE: We will move on to Ordinances and Resolutions beginning with Ordinance 58-2020. Will the Clerk please read the title.

CLMN NENADOVICH: Mr. Chairman, if I may, before you go on? I'm getting somebody washing dishes and the sound is very loud in my phone.

PRESIDENT BURKE: I hear it too, Mr. Nenadovich. Unfortunately, I can mute everybody but then you would not be able to vote. You may have to hit star 6 to do so. I could do that. I don't want to take anybody's rights away from being able to speak, but unfortunately, I just wish everybody could cooperate. Let's try this one more time and if we continue to have the background noise, then I will mute everybody.

Ordinance 58-2020. Will the Clerk please read the title.

ORDINANCE NO. 58-2020

AN EMERGENCY ORDINANCE AUTHORIZING AND DIRECTING THE MAYOR, OR HIS DESIGNEE, TO DO ALL THINGS NECESSARY, TO SPONSOR THE CLEVELAND CLINIC IN THEIR EFFORT TO SUBMIT A TRANSPORTATION REVIEW ADVISORY COUNCIL (TRAC) APPLICATION FOR FUNDING OF THE I-480 / GRANGER ROAD INTERCHANGE IMPROVEMENT PROJECT.

Moved by BURKE to CONSIDER BY TITLE:

AYES: Burke, Vaughn, Dudley, Donahue, Nenadovich, Davis, Blake

Motion to SUSPEND THREE READING RULE:

AYES: Burke, Vaughn, Dudley, Donahue, Nenadovich, Davis, Blake

VOTE ON ADOPTION:

PRESIDENT BURKE: Before I vote, I just want to make a comment to let everybody know that all I'm voting on here and all we're voting on here is to sponsor the Cleveland Clinic allowing them to put together a Transportation Review Advisory Council. This does not mean that they're going to start construction tomorrow. It means that they're really just looking at the planning stage right now and in talking to the City Engineer, etc., etc. This has been something that has been talked about for over five years now. With that, I vote Yes.

CLMN NENADOVICH: Before I vote, Mr. Burke, thank you for that explanation. I'm sure it's explained well. I vote Yes.

AYES: Burke, Vaughn, Dudley, Donahue, Nenadovich, Davis, Blake

Ordinance 58-2020 passes with 7 Yes votes.

ORDINANCE NO. 60-2020

AN EMERGENCY ORDINANCE TO AMEND APPROPRIATIONS FOR CURRENT EXPENDITURES FOR THE CITY OF GARFIELD HEIGHTS, OHIO, DURING THE FISCAL YEAR ENDING DECEMBER 31, 2020.

Moved by BURKE to CONSIDER BY TITLE:
AYES: Burke, Vaughn, Dudley, Donahue, Nenadovich, Davis, Blake

Motion to SUSPEND THREE READING RULE:
AYES: Burke, Vaughn, Dudley, Donahue, Nenadovich, Davis, Blake

Motion to WAIVE RULE 24:
AYES: Burke, Vaughn, Dudley, Donahue, Nenadovich, Davis, Blake

VOTE ON ADOPTION:
AYES: Burke, Vaughn, Dudley, Donahue, Nenadovich, Davis, Blake
Ordinance 60-2020 passes with 7 Yes votes.

ORDINANCE NO. 61-2020

AN EMERGENCY ORDINANCE AUTHORIZING AND DIRECTING DAVID KROCK, CITY ENGINEER, TO PREPARE THE NECESSARY BOUNDARY SERVICES, PER THE OHM ADVISORS PROPOSAL FOR CUYAHOGA COUNTY PN 546-07-013 – LOT SPLIT PROJECT LOCATED AT 4700 EAST 131ST STREET AND AUTHORIZING PAYMENT OF COSTS FOR THIS PROJECT.

Moved by BURKE to CONSIDER BY TITLE:
AYES: Burke, Vaughn, Dudley, Donahue, Nenadovich, Davis, Blake

Motion to SUSPEND THREE READING RULE:
AYES: Burke, Vaughn, Dudley, Donahue, Nenadovich, Davis, Blake

Motion to WAIVE RULE 24:
AYES: Burke, Vaughn, Dudley, Donahue, Nenadovich, Davis, Blake

VOTE ON ADOPTION:
AYES: Burke, Vaughn, Dudley, Donahue, Nenadovich, Davis, Blake
Ordinance 61-2020 passes with 7 Yes votes.

ORDINANCE NO. 62-2020

AN EMERGENCY ORDINANCE AUTHORIZING AND DIRECTING DAVID KROCK, CITY ENGINEER, TO PREPARE THE NECESSARY PLANS AND SPECIFICATIONS, PER OHM ADVISORS PROPOSAL ATTACHED HERETO AS EXHIBIT "A", AND TO COMPETITIVELY BID FOR THE 4909 ORCHARD SLOPE REPAIR PROJECT, AND AUTHORIZING THE PAYMENT OF COSTS FOR THIS PROJECT, WHICH COSTS WILL BE REIMBURSED THROUGH THE CUYAHOGA COUNTY COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT BLOCK GRANT PROGRAM AS IDENTIFIED IN EXHIBIT "B" ATTACHED HERETO.

Moved by BURKE to CONSIDER BY TITLE:
AYES: Burke, Vaughn, Dudley, Donahue, Nenadovich, Davis, Blake

Motion to SUSPEND THREE READING RULE:
AYES: Burke, Vaughn, Dudley, Donahue, Nenadovich, Davis, Blake

Motion to WAIVE RULE 24:
AYES: Burke, Vaughn, Dudley, Donahue, Nenadovich, Davis, Blake

VOTE ON ADOPTION:
AYES: Burke, Vaughn, Dudley, Donahue, Nenadovich, Davis, Blake

Ordinance 62-2020 passed with 7 Yes votes.

ORDINANCE NO. 63-2020

AN EMERGENCY ORDINANCE AUTHORIZING AND DIRECTING DAVID KROCK, CITY ENGINEER, TO PREPARE THE NECESSARY PLANS AND SPECIFICATIONS, PER THE OHM ADVISORS PROPOSAL, AND TO GO OUT FOR COMPETITIVE BIDS, FOR THE GRANGER ROAD HILL STORM SEWER PROJECT, AND AUTHORIZING PAYMENT OF COSTS FOR THIS PROJECT.

Moved by BURKE to CONSIDER BY TITLE:

AYES: Burke, Vaughn, Dudley, Donahue, Nenadovich, Davis, Blake

Motion to SUSPEND THREE READING RULE:

AYES: Burke, Vaughn, Dudley, Donahue, Nenadovich, Davis, Blake

Motion to WAIVE RULE 24:

AYES: Burke, Vaughn, Dudley, Donahue, Nenadovich, Davis, Blake

VOTE ON ADOPTION:

AYES: Burke, Vaughn, Dudley, Donahue, Nenadovich, Davis, Blake

Ordinance 63-2020 passes with 7 Yes votes.

ORDINANCE NO. 64-2020

AN EMERGENCY ORDINANCE AUTHORIZING AND DIRECTING THE MAYOR OR HIS DESIGNEE TO ENTER INTO AN AGREEMENT WITH TELETRONICS, INC. FOR THE PURPOSE OF UPGRADING THE DATA BASE BACKUP AND DISASTER RECOVERY STORAGE.

Moved by BURKE to CONSIDER BY TITLE:

AYES: Burke, Vaughn, Dudley, Donahue, Nenadovich, Davis, Blake

Motion to SUSPEND THREE READING RULE:

AYES: Burke, Vaughn, Dudley, Donahue, Nenadovich, Davis, Blake

Motion to WAIVE RULE 24:

AYES: Burke, Vaughn, Dudley, Donahue, Nenadovich, Davis, Blake

VOTE ON ADOPTION:

AYES: Burke, Vaughn, Dudley, Donahue, Nenadovich, Davis, Blake

Ordinance 64-2020 passes with 7 Yes votes.

RESOLUTION NO. 17-2020

AN EMERGENCY RESOLUTION ADOPTING THE TAX BUDGET OF THE CITY OF GARFIELD HEIGHTS, OHIO FOR THE FISCAL YEAR BEGINNING JANUARY 1, 2021, HERETO ATTACHED, AND SUBMITTING THE SAME TO THE CUYAHOGA COUNTY BUDGET COMMISSION.

Moved by BURKE to CONSIDER BY TITLE:

AYES: Burke, Vaughn, Dudley, Donahue, Nenadovich, Davis, Blake

Motion to SUSPEND THREE READING RULE:

AYES: Burke, Vaughn, Dudley, Donahue, Nenadovich, Davis, Blake

Motion to WAIVE RULE 24:

AYES: Burke, Vaughn, Dudley, Donahue, Nenadovich, Davis, Blake

VOTE ON ADOPTION:

AYES: Burke, Vaughn, Dudley, Donahue, Nenadovich, Davis, Blake
Resolution 17-2020 passes with 7 Yes votes.

RESOLUTION NO. 18-2020

AN EMERGENCY RESOLUTION AUTHORIZING THE MAYOR TO APPLY FOR A DIESEL MITIGATION TRUST FUND GRANT THROUGH THE STATE OF OHIO ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION AGENCY.

Moved by BURKE to CONSIDER BY TITLE:

AYES: Burke, Vaughn, Dudley, Donahue, Nenadovich, Davis, Blake

Motion to SUSPEND THREE READING RULE:

AYES: Burke, Vaughn, Dudley, Donahue, Nenadovich, Davis, Blake

Motion to WAIVE RULE 24:

AYES: Burke, Vaughn, Dudley, Donahue, Nenadovich, Davis, Blake

VOTE ON ADOPTION:

AYES: Burke, Vaughn, Dudley, Donahue, Nenadovich, Davis, Blake
Resolution 18-2020 passes with 7 Yes votes.

WRITTEN COMMUNICATIONS TO COUNCIL:

PRESIDENT BURKE: That concludes our Ordinances and Resolutions for this evening. At this time, we have placed the Written Communications to Council on the agenda. I know there have been quite a few e-mails and letters. Barb, would you go ahead and start reading. Pick a letter and start reading.

CLERK: Would you like me to read the long one that was sent to us by several residents?

PRESIDENT BURKE: Sure.

CLERK: I'm going to read a letter that had a caption top from Ariana Johnson, from Kimberly Maloy and Daniel Daughn. The letter reads:

“Sunday July 15, 2020

President Matthew Burke, Mayor Vic Collova, and Members of Garfield Heights City Council,

The citizens of Garfield Heights have come together with great concern of the leadership in our community.

We call for Ward 2 Councilman Charles Donahue Jr. to voluntarily resign/step down from his role as an elected official. As residents of this city, we do not feel safe, and we are not confident in his ability to fairly represent and make ethical decisions for the community that is approximately 48% Black, 48% White and 4% other. If this does not

happen, we are ready to band together and unite with the residents of Ward 2 to move forward with an official recall with the Board of Elections.

As taxpayers in this city, we are demanding respect for all humans who live here. In light of the recent police brutality incident and numerous community events calling for equality and fair treatment, this kind of behavior should not be tolerated.

An elected official carries a special torch; elected officials take an oath and swear to faithfully, honestly, diligently, and impartially perform and discharge all of the powers and duties incumbent upon me. They have a special role; they are the leaders of our community and they should be pushing and fighting for the greater good of the entire community. If arguing and threatening with weapons to visiting drivers who come to our city to shop and support business, calling the police on delivery drivers who are being essential to so many residents right now, and sharing hurtful, discriminatory memos on Facebook is what you perceive to be good character of a Councilman, then I think it is time for our city to re-evaluate our entire committee of City Leadership.

Per the Charter of Garfield Heights, noted in Section 11, the rules of council include "It may expel any member for gross misconduct, or malfeasance in or disqualification from office, or for conviction of a crime involving moral turpitude while in office, or violation of this Charter, or persistent failure to abide by the rules of the Council;" and "If Council fails to review the election and to monitor the qualifications of its members, the Mayor shall authorize and direct the Law Director to take appropriate action regarding said election and qualifications".

As residents, for the past 90 days, we have continued to endure poor behavior choices from Councilman Charles Donahue Jr. of Ward 2. The residents have experienced egregious pain from his behaviors. We, as the electors of every elected official in Garfield Heights, are demanding a response from city leadership as well as that this letter be read on the council floor on Monday July 12, 2020.

Humbly Submitted the Aggrieved Citizens of Garfield Heights,

Chloe Ervin
Dannaro Dozier I
Rhonda Wylie-Ervin
Jermaine Thomas Sr.
Jermaine Thomas Jr.
Yolanda Maddox
Felecia Maddox
Roy Brown
Yvonne Lisuala
Logan Ervin
Jose Ervin Sr.
Jose Ervin Jr.
Brittany Ervin
Ariana Johnson
Nichelle Daniels

Anthony Isom
Daniel Daughn
Semeca Prather-Solomon
Lenice Bozema
Michael Bozeman
Kim Maloy
William Johnson Sr
Titiana Robinson
Tawnee Williams
Devlin Pope
Rochelle Elliott
John Elliott
Janice Stennett
Janine El –Amin
Janice Tubbs
Tania Martin
Daija Averyheart
Damion Daniels
Jasmine Tyus
Nikki Washington
Richard Thompson II
Ashley Thomas
Annette Nurse
Archie Nurse
Anthony Littlejo
Michelle Littlejohn
Crystal Simms
Ricardo Simms
Angie Weever
Latonya Martin
Diamonn Rogers
Melodi Jackson
Nokisha Tobias
Latasha Stallworth
Scharon Davis
Gina Ware
Luann Wagner
Shauna Scott Rose
Sandra Middleton
Randy Westerfield
Michael Davis
Kimberly Fortson
Estelle Fortson
Eric Owens
Phillip Austin
Richard Prichard
Demetrius Graham
Mary Carter Simms

Darlene Outler
Joni Wanderstock
Kenneth Temple
Keara Jefferson
Marsharee Crawford
Karl Blevins
Llyod Henry
Charmella Price
Ronda Crayton
Joshua Crayton
Timmia Crayton
Stacey Collier
Hellen Collier
Lawrence Collier
Lauren Bonner
Jerrell Tyree"

That is the end of that letter.

PRESIDENT BURKE: OK.

CLERK: Mr. Chairman, shall I read the next? Or do you have a comment?

PRESIDENT BURKE: No. Go ahead and read the next letter. The next letter I believe is from Lanene Jones.

CLERK: Yes, this is from Lanene Jones, dated Sunday, July 12, 2020.

"Hello,

My name is Lanene Jones and I reside at 13204 Eastwood Blvd. I'm sending this email to you today to stress my concerns about the growing racial tensions in our city and the lack of interest or urgency to address it from some of our leadership. Additionally, I want to offer some solutions that may benefit this community as a whole.

I sent an email out to you all on June 22, 2020, regarding the need for police reform. I subsequently shared my concerns regarding Officer Malek during the council meeting later on that evening. Since then, I have participated in the community event on June 25th regarding racism and policing issues that was hosted by the Rock Community Church. After the event, I felt deflated by the comments made by Mayor Vic Collova and Councilman Nenadovich. After everyone voiced their concerns, shared their experiences, and called for change, the Mayor and Nenadovich proudly proclaimed that they were behind the police department 100%. The Mayor went as far as to say that they were "his boys". It made me wonder if they had even heard a word that was discussed that evening. Their answers were tone deaf and dismissive. Why even attend an event if your intent was to ignore the concerns of the residents that live and vote in this city?

My friend and I had a conversation with Mr. Nenadovich after the event where he doubled down on backing the police 100%. That conversation was like speaking to a brick wall and it made me think about the leadership that we have in this city and how they came to be in a leadership position. It made me think about the residents of his ward and whether or not their voices are ever heard or is he pushing his own agenda. If he and the Mayor back the police 100%, what percentage is left for the residents that voted for them and even the ones that didn't? This is the dilemma that I am struggling with right now. I know that I am not the only resident of this city feeling this way. There were other Councilpersons at the event that seemed to be listening and aware of what kinds of change this city needs, but the fact that you all are not standing as a united front is also disturbing. Not all council members were present for whatever reason and that was a missed chance for you to hear from the residents in your ward. I know that you can't be everywhere all of the time, but something as important as this should've never be missed in my opinion.

After that meeting, I had decided that I would no longer speak out because the message is falling on deaf ears. I thought maybe I would just start working on voter registration and asking the community to be more active in getting to know their representatives. However, two things happened that caused me to have to speak out today. The first was seeing derogatory posts on Facebook from Councilman Donahue regarding black men and his apparent views of them. The second was seeing a post from a person visiting the Giant Eagle and being threatened by guns from the same Councilman. This city's population is comprised of almost 50% black people. What percentage of black people does Mr. Donahue represent in his ward? Do they know of his views? Does their quality of life matter to him? Are their voices being heard? I doubt it given the fact that he believes that black men that protest police brutality are bitches, his words not mine, or robbers. I do not think Mr. Donahue has the ability to effectively represent ALL of his community without bias. Everyone has the freedom of speech under our Constitution; however, they do not have the freedom of consequences from those words. You can't tell the President of the United States that you will kill him without consequences. You can't commit libel without consequences. Consequences ensure that people that are a danger or threat to themselves or their community are removed from their position of power. People all over this country are being fired and removed from their positions because of their racists remarks and ideologies. Councilman Donahue is no different and should be removed as well. It deeply saddens me that a lot of you and your family members were friends on Mr. Donahue's friend's list that I copied from his page (attached) and it makes me wonder how many of you saw his divisive posts and also feels the same way. The Mayor, Mr. Nenadovich, Judge Nicastro, Councilman Vaughn, Councilman Dudley, and my Councilman Burke were all friends on his friend's list. I've only seen one councilman on that specific list admonish his actions; Councilman Dudley. Additionally, Councilwoman Shayla Davis admonished his actions publicly when it was brought to her attention. Ironically, they are the only two black people on City Council. To the remaining of you, your silence speaks volumes. In the words of Dr. Martin Luther King, "There comes a time when silence is betrayal. Our lives begin to end the day we become silent about things that matter. In the end, we will remember not the words of our enemies, but the silence of our friends. Only in the darkness can you see the stars." To Councilwoman Davis and Councilman

Dudley, I'm sure the great Councilwoman Fannie Lewis is smiling down on the both you.

Listen, you all have a seat at the table, some have been sitting there much longer than others. No time is promised to you. The time to act is now. This is your time to enforce change and to ensure that every citizen feels safe and represented here. To Council and the Mayor specifically, you all ran races to be elected into your position. You were elected to represent me and people that look like me too. My voice, opinion, and tax dollars matter. I've already told you that I do not feel safe with Officer Malek on the street. He is unstable and you all gave plenty of reasons why you couldn't fire him: the Union, the litigation, money, hiring, etc. None of them is a real legitimate reason for not removing him from duty. If you wanted to do it, you would and you would deal with the consequences as they may come for the safety of your community. Your message to the black community is that you will back a rogue police officer 100% regardless of how they treat us. You will keep them on the payroll terrorizing us in our city while they spend their paychecks in the cities where they live. You will pay out thousands of dollars of taxpayer money to keep someone in power that is a threat to our civil liberties. I am asking you again to remove him from his duties to protect your integrity and to protect the safety of the black community that lives here, raises children, shops, and pays taxes in this city. We should be your greater concern.

I am also asking you to remove Councilman Donahue. I find his stance deeply offensive. My father was military and a black man, both of which he is very proud. When he returned home from Japan, he was denied service at a food counter at a Mexican restaurant while wearing his full uniform because the owner did not want to scare off the white customers. If he could kneel for justice today, he would. Sadly, his health is failing but he never fails to remind me to keep up the good fight. Black men have been fighting for civil liberties since before the Civil Rights Movement. By definition, civil means to be courteous and polite. We've been literally fighting for people to just be courteous and polite to us for hundreds of years and it is exhausting to say the least. Councilman Donahue dishonored my father, me and the black community when he posted those offensive posts suggesting that black people are thieves and bitches. He acted like a thug in a suit with a gun when he had that road rage incident in the Giant Eagle's parking lot. He too is unstable and doesn't deserve his position of power. He should consider stepping down on his own. However, if he chooses not to do so, I am asking that you follow your charter rules and start the removal process of Councilman Donahue immediately. You need to call out your colleagues when you see this kind of behavior. You spend more time with them than the community as a whole does and you have a better grasp of who they are and what they believe. You need to alert the community of these kinds of actions when they come to light. Thankfully, social media has been a surprising and welcome advocate in showing everyone what we've been talking about for hundreds of years. Racism is alive and well in America and in Garfield Heights Ohio too.

Please consider both of my requests. This community is changing and the residents need more from you. We deserve it.

Many Regards,

Lanene Jones, MPA
13204 Eastwood Blvd
216-374-9227

Attachment includes:

My response to Mr. Donahue's offensive post in Messenger (I was later blocked without a response)

Mr. Donahue's offensive posts

A post by a visitor of the City of Garfield Heights that was threatened by Mr. Donahue

A copy of Mr. Donahue's friends list"

CLERK: I printed out these attachments but the messages are incomplete because they were like photographs. So I'm sorry. They are incomplete. I cannot read them to you. It would not make sense. They are just words, but that is the end of that letter.

PRESIDENT BURKE: That's fine, Barb. Are there any other letters?

CLERK: Yes.

CLMN VAUGHN: Excuse me, Chairman Burke.

PRESIDENT BURKE: Yes.

CLMN VAUGHN: This is Clmn Vaughn. I'm signing out now.

PRESIDENT BURKE: OK. Thank you, Tom. Tell your son we all said Happy Birthday.

CLMN VAUGHN: Thank you. I appreciate it. Bye now. *(8:15 p.m.)*

CLERK: Yes, President Burke. I have one more letter.

PRESIDENT BURKE: OK. Why don't you go ahead and read that letter.

CLERK: All right. This letter is from Ms. Ronda Crayton and is dated July 12, 2020:

"I would like for this letter to be read at the July 13th 2020 City Council meeting.

Dear Councilman Dudley, my name is Ronda Crayton and I am a long time tax-paying citizen of The City of Garfield Heights. I have been here for 53 years, born in Marymount Hospital, and educated through the Garfield Heights school systems from K-12th grade. I am a Ward 1 resident and I have watched the community evolve and change drastically. I have hope for this community and I have tried to invest, support, and volunteer my time as best I can.

Although I have been asked by several residence to find out what can we do as a people to remove elected officials from office who display public comments or actions that are offensive to women, religious groups, and people of color; for now I am only

representing myself in this initial letter. Understanding that a person does have a right to freedom of speech, that does right does not apply when you represent the people and the oath you took in a public office as an elected official.

The recent social media posts, conduct, and comments that have been presented by Councilman Donahue are unprofessional, and an embarrassment to The City of Garfield Heights and its residence. We are requesting that Councilman Donahue voluntarily step down, or that the Mayor remove him from his position immediately.

The electors shall have the power to remove from office by recall election any elected officer of the city. If necessary the electors will have a petition equal to or greater than 20% prepared to file with the Clerks office in anticipation for a recall election if Councilman Donahue remains in office. In light of the current climate in our city, I hope the current council members and mayor do the right thing. We need our leaders and residence to work together for peace; not turn a blind eye.

Respectfully Submitted

Ms. Ronda Crayton"

That's the last letter.

PRESIDENT BURKE: Thank you, Barb.

CLERK: You're welcome.

MISCELLANEOUS COMMENTS BY CITIZENS

PRESIDENT BURKE: We have had these letters read and I'm going to go ahead and give some people a chance to respond. The Council people—we will have Miscellaneous Business so you'll get a chance to respond. At this time I want to move to Comments by Citizens. I will ask the Clerk to read one more thing and that is just the rules for the comments by the citizens. If you could please read that.

CLERK: Comments shall be restricted to any problem a citizen has which has previously been submitted to his/her Councilperson or to the city hall department directly involved. If submission of a problem to a city hall department or a Councilperson is made and there is a lack of service rendered in this regard, the problem may then be presented during Comments from Citizens at a future meeting. It is the intention of this rule that no request of a first nature is presented on the floor at this time. Comments shall be limited to five minutes. No citizen shall be heard more than once.

PRESIDENT BURKE: Are there any citizens that would like to make a comment at this time?

Estella Fortune, 4481 Martin Luther King Blvd. I would like to know what can be done about the overgrowth of the trees and weeds from the fire station down to Broadway on East 131st Street on the east side. People are having to walk in the street to keep from getting hit in the face and yes and it's very dangerous. Someone needs to come out and take a look at it.

MAYOR VIC COLLOVA: Mr. Chairman.

PRESIDENT BURKE: Yes, Mayor Collova.

MAYOR VIC COLLOVA: Mayor Collova. Estelle, may I ask you a question. Is this vacant property we're talking about?

MS. FORTUNE: We're talking about the park on the east side of the street coming down the hill.

MAYOR VIC COLLOVA: OK. The park? All right. I will take a look at it.

MS. FORTUNE: Thank you.

MAYOR VIC COLLOVA: You're welcome.

CLMN DUDLEY: Mr. Chairman.

PRESIDENT BURKE: Yes, Mr. Dudley.

CLMN DUDLEY: I already called that in and e-mailed. I know what you're talking about on Forestdale Park up to Garden Apartments. I talked to Jennifer the other day and e-mailed it in it got so bad you can't even walk up there the overgrowth is ridiculous. I did call that in and I did e-mail that in the other day and they said they was going to put somebody on it but I know what you're talking about. It's absolutely terrible. But I did call it in.

PRESIDENT BURKE: Thank you, Mr. Dudley. Is there anyone else wishing to make any comments this evening?

Lenene Jones, 13204 Eastwood.

PRESIDENT BURKE: You have the floor, Ms. Jones.

MS. JONES: Thank you. I didn't know my letter was going to be read but I did want to say something. I think after I read the letter one of the things came to mind. I wanted to say that the Council Member and specifically Clmn Donahue. This is now a very diverse community that you represent. Please let me remind you who you represent in this community. You represent the wealthy and the poor. You represent the white collar and the blue collar. You represent the people that you trust are good and the people that are bad. You represent the people that have the same qualities that you have and you represent the ones that don't. You represent people who you consider the cream of the crop and the ones that you consider to be the scum of the Earth. You represent the residents that voted for you and the ones that did not. You represent those that are outspoken in the community and those that are silent. You represent those who are White, those who are Black and those that are everything in between. You represent the able bodied and the disabled. You represent the old, young, middle aged and anyone that has decided to make Garfield Heights their home. You represent the outstanding citizens and those that has went to jail. You represent the entire community, not just the ones that you consider worthy to be of your reputation. Everyone is who you represent. If you have forgotten that will

be your reminder. Your job is to bring the community better as a whole and not just for one group of the population. That is the weight of the burden.

You guys there when you become an elected official, Mr. Donahue specifically, the person that you accosted said it is OK to spend money. I don't know if he lives here. I don't know if he came here just to spend money, but your cowboy attitude ran him off. You threatened a person with two guns over a road rage incident--an elected official. You could have taken the high road and introduced yourself and asked him to be careful when driving around there. So let me tell you what I believe. You are your true authentic self when you think no one is watching. When you think no one is watching you like to post derogatory memes for your friends related to Black people. You desire to create changes in the community. We're fighting against police brutality. That somehow is a threat to you in your existence. A whole community is crying out for help because they're tired of making up the majority of the jail population. They're tired of being beaten and violated of their civil rights repeatedly and killed on camera. That is a problem for you somehow. You are repulsed by that somehow, enough so to pose memes that emasculate Black men and represent them as thieves.

Make no mistake we have received just a glance of who you really are and that is enough for me to know that you don't deserve to represent me or anyone that looks like me. I want to make this clear. Anyone that feels like they can't represent their whole community should not be at the table. Especially if you only provided good will for half of your community. I'm asking for you to take the initiative to step down on your own and allow a new generation to make a more diverse community pool cohesive environment. I don't believe you have the tenacity to do so. If you decide to stay and fight, I'm imploring the rest of your colleagues to take the necessary to help us remove you. Thank you for your time.

PRESIDENT BURKE: Thank you, Ms. Jones. Is there anyone else who would like to address Council?

Janice Tubbs, 13717 Dressler Avenue. There is a lot of talk about the First Amendment. I want to be very clear. The First Amendment does not cover hate speech. Hate speech is defined as abusive or frightening speech or writing that expresses prejudice against a particular group, especially on the basis of race, religion or sexual orientation. So we do have the right of free speech, but with that comes responsibility. All elected officials beyond the city of Garfield Heights. This applies to anyone in an elected position throughout the United States of America. No elected official walks out of their front door and just falls into an elected seat. You pursue that. You come to the community and you ask for our support. You ask for our votes. In doing so, you are engaging in a public trust. When you betray the public trust by not representing the entire community, that you took an oath to uphold and represent, you've broken that trust. Each of us has to be responsible for our actions. And elected officials, whether we want to accept it or not, are held to a higher standard. You have asked for that when you asked for our votes. The people want to conduct themselves as ordinary everyday citizens you have that right, but when you ask them to vote for you then you ask us to elevate you to a level of leadership and you take an oath to do that, you owe the community more than the average citizen. I thank you for your time.

PRESIDENT BURKE: Thank you, Ms. Tubbs. Is there anyone else that would like to address Council?

James Fruits, 13600 York Blvd. I want to speak of a few things. I wanted to thank everyone for coming out and being part of the community conversation that we held and already mentioned in a previous letter. I wanted to thank the Mayor and the Police Chief and the police officers that came out, as well as the Council Members that came out and especially our community members that came out to be a part of that important event and part of those conversations. I wanted to express my gratitude for everyone who came and who helped that event to go well and I hope that a lot of learning and understanding took place there in those small groups. I believe that it's through conversations like that that change will begin to take place in our community. So I thank everyone for coming to that event. I want you to know that Mr. Peters and I will be debriefing with the moderator about that.

I do want to address the comments by Clmn Donahue. In the first letter that was read, my wife's name and my name, James and Christian Fruits, were also added to those signatures on one of the versions that was sent in and not the one that was read. I believe there are 130 signatures on that particular letter that was read and sent in. As I listened tonight to that letter being read, I was astounded because that was a lot. I would say that over the course of the year that that probably represents a larger number than typical for correspondence with City Council. I implore City Council to take this issue very seriously, not to be dismissive, not to take it personally as an attack on leadership because when we talked about in last month's City Council Meeting, when people asked me if the community conversation was going to be attacking City Council, my response there was that it was not my intent, but it probably would have made City Council uncomfortable on that leadership. Right now if there is (*inaudible*) present during the conversation then it is going to affect the outcome negatively. I implore you to try and steer the things that have been said tonight have been stated so incredibly well in the letters that have been read that City Council has to consider this.

The images that Clmn Donahue posted, particularly one in response to people who kneel, is offensive to anybody who stands on the side of having a problem with systemic racism in our community. It's also offensive to women in the terms that were used and in the sexual innuendoes intended in that image. That is extremely egregious as well as I believe the Council has reservations about asking Clmn Donahue to step down because that is a big step. Clmn Donahue, I speak directly to you tonight and I ask that you remove yourself because there is a rift on why there are six different things to implement, to offensive pictures, to offend the residents, which were abused. If the City Council stands by and doesn't do anything then it undermines the city leadership in such a large part of our constituency. I'm not talking about just people who are Black because it shows (*inaudible*) failure to take action. In the community, there are so many things going on and public statements. I would like to hear public statements from other Council Members tonight saying that Clmn Donahue's actions are not acceptable.

Clmn Donahue, I call for an apology at the very least tonight—a humble apology from you so that trust can start to be figured out again. I stand with everyone who has called for you to stand down because honestly I don't see a way back from this that you can regain trust of the members of your Ward. So I submit that now is a crucial time to take action. We need to see and hear leadership tonight in the things that our City Council Members say.

MAYOR VIC COLLOVA: Mr. Chairman, Mayor Collova.

PRESIDENT BURKE: Yes, Mayor. Do you want to respond?

MAYOR VIC COLLOVA: I'd like to respond to James. There's a couple issues I'd like to respond to your comments. Number one you said this wasn't anything offensive to any of the city officials. It was something that needed to be addressed. I believe that's something like what you said. Is that correct?

MR. FRUITS: I said that this is not personal. This is a city issue.

MAYOR VIC COLLOVA: OK. Let me ask you this. First, when I receive letters and e-mails saying that because I support the police--I'm racist. When I receive e-mails and letters that say not all the Council people are there--they should have been--they were all there. When they say that we've done nothing, not knowing what position I took with Chuck at this time, OK, and I'm continually threatened that we'll vote you in and we'll vote you out, should I take this personal? Is there a reason for me to take this personal or should I just accept it because that's what the movement is about? The agenda is whatever is thrown at you, you accept, because we got this great movement going on.

I take personal offense being called a racist. Anybody that knows me, any of my neighbors, any of my family, any person that I know knows I'm not racist, but I have to agree to it because it's not personal. It's more than personal, believe me.

And my feeling towards Chuck Donahue is this. I may be 100% honest with everybody. I totally disagree with kneeling at the flag. I think it's totally disrespectful. As a Veteran, most Veterans feel that way. But if that's what you want to do, God Bless you. Do what you think you got to do. That doesn't mean I have to accept it.

Now the other parts of it, the wording and the language, I'm totally opposed to. It shouldn't have happened. But I'm not opposed to the flag part of it. Chuck and I had this conversation. It's no different than me being Italian. Take down Columbus's statue because that's the agenda we want. Columbus discovered America and he was Italian. I got to say, you know what, 100 years ago he might have shot an arrow at an Indian or vice versa so let's take his statue down. We're starting to push the envelope a little far, James. And yes, I do take it personal.

But I will tell you this. The residents vote us in through election and they can vote us out through election. I don't think it's fair, in my opinion only, that we on Council remove Chuck without a vote of the people. The people put him in. Let the people take him out. I think that is fair. It's not what the agenda wants, but I think that's fair. So James, I just want you to know that it's not all what you say it is. You can't believe some of the e-mails and calls we're getting here. I'm telling you—threats—but that's OK because the agenda says it's OK. Thank you.

MR. FRUITS: May I respond to the Mayor?

PRESIDENT BURKE: Absolutely, James. Go ahead.

MR. FRUITS: Mr. Mayor, I have not called you a racist. I know you didn't say that I did. I have not called you a racist. Mr. Mayor, though, your reaction tonight. I'm not going to respond to you by raising your voice like you did to me. Your response does tell me that you are not

able to put yourself in the seat of the people in your community who are telling you their concerns. You have just mentioned the movement. But you're not getting e-mails from the movement, Mr. Mayor. You're getting e-mails from people who live in your community. I'm just calling it like I see it. You have dismissed those already tonight by what you just said to me. Mr. Mayor, you are in leadership, you're going to get e-mails, you're going to be called issues. This is not about a movement or an agenda. This is about equal treatment of people and Mr. Donahue has stated things publicly that led the constituency in Garfield Heights to become distrustful of the leadership. I have great respect for you. We've worked together in the community for years, but I am very disappointed in your response to me.

MAYOR VIC COLLOVA: Let me ask you, if I can, James, we have an issue with a police officer that you're all very well aware of and it's been spoken about many times today. OK? In one of the letters it doesn't matter if we get sued, it doesn't matter what it costs, we should remove him now. As la leader of this community, you show responsibility not to throw money away. So I have a pretty good idea, after investigating this whole thing that these officers, for this incident alone, nothing else, this incident also have not done enough to be removed. But I can't get into it because it's all legal. I know people don't want to hear that. Do you understand right now that it's under litigation and we can't talk about the Court case? The Law Department's on here. They will tell you right now. What the matter is is that when people tell me remove him or else and I know I feel pretty confident that it will cost us some serious money—to taxpayers, not mine, the taxpayers—should I just remove him and pay the consequences? Because that's what some of the residents want? I mean I also as Mayor have a responsibility to the entire city.

Again, I'm not saying the movement is wrong. I'm saying that the movement wants me to do these things that we can't do. But they want us to do them anyway and pay the consequences later. This could cost the city hundred's of thousand's of dollars. Say this thing goes down the road and it rules that he was wrong? Then we can take whatever action is necessary. But right now we can't do that, but that's not what everybody's telling me. That's not all the e-mails I get. That's not what you want, I don't believe. You have to understand city leaders are in a different position. I do not want to see anybody—Black, White, Red, green—anybody not treated fairly. That's the God's honest truth on my kids. I don't want to see anybody stopped when they should not have been stopped. I agree with that 100%. But as the leader of this city, I have to do what the law dictates. Right now, the law is not saying that these guys are wrong at this point. So James, how would I respond now? How would I respond to the letters and by rights if I'm not getting rid of this police officer right now, I'm not going along with the community so I should be removed as Mayor because that's not what the community (which you are involved with) wants me to do. I could show you letters. Everybody wants this guy removed and fired immediately. I can't do that. They want it, so, James, what would you do if you were Mayor James Fruits?

MR. FRUITS: Well I'm not going to be Mayor James Fruits. What I would like to say to that is that I have a couple questions and a couple thoughts on that. One, I would like to know. You keep addressing the movement. I tried to move you away from that to the residents because that's who this is about. I would like to know from you before I continue the rest of my answer, who is the movement?

MAYOR VIC COLLOVA: The movement is what's going on through this country about Black Lives Matter. I agree with it 100%. Just the movement. What I'm saying is the movement is going too far. I think in some cases it is. That's what the movement is and I thought that was what the whole world was talking about right now. The movement for Black Lives Matter. Equal rights. Is that not what the movement is?

MR. FRUITS: Yes, I was just asking for clarification from you to make sure that costs and money, I would like to say a couple of things. One, I know that money does not grow on trees but I don't think we should make decisions about people being removed based on money. I think we should make decisions on police matters on what is right. That is how I respond. I think you should do what is right, Mr. Mayor.

MAYOR VIC COLLOVA: If I could cut in here a second? If in fact, we have a group of investigators saying that the officers did nothing wrong. If we had that and the people that saw the video said he did do something wrong, you want me to do what's right, what should I do, Mayor James Fruits? What would you do?

MR. FRUITS: Please don't refer to me as Mayor James Fruits.

MAYOR VIC COLLOVA: I'm just joking with you. You know that, James. Put yourself in my position. What should I do? When I have experts telling me this thing has got to go to Court because there's a lot more and you'll all hear about it shortly, there's a lot more involved than what you know right now. You don't know that. I can't tell you, but to do what's right, I have to let this guy go. That's the tough part of being the Mayor or city leader because you have to look at everything and that's the position I'm in. So somebody calls up and says you better fire this guy right now. I don't want to hear no more. He's terrible. Fire him right now. What do I do James?

MR. FRUITS: Mr. Mayor, I don't have all the information you have. I don't care for you to put me in that position and ask me to make that call.

MAYOR VIC COLLOVA: If you did, James, if you had some information that showed that these officers might not be everything that the people are making them up to be, if you had that information, would you fire them?

MR. FRUITS: Mr. Mayor, here's what I would do. Again this is about as far as I can go because I don't have all the information. And I may have been wrong. I have not seen this addressed anywhere. I would put him on leave until the investigation's over. Has that been done?

MAYOR VIC COLLOVA: No, it has not.

MR. FRUITS: No. That's the first thing I would do because if this incident if this officer is in the wrong, we're letting him police our community now and we don't know it. You stood behind him so you trust him to be out there, but you know who does not trust him—your residents. I think the first thing I would do is put him on administrative leave until this is situated. That's as far as the information I have I can advise you to do. If firing the officer was the right thing to do, that's what I would do, Mr. Mayor, no matter how much it's going to cost us. I would do it

for our community. This conversation. I think our city needs to feel a lot more from our leadership right now. When city leadership is in defensiveness it does not lend itself to trust from anyone who is not White in our community and I can tell from the defensiveness from this conversation that there doesn't seem to be openness. Maybe this officer needs to be fired.

MAYOR VIC COLLOVA: But again.

MR. FRUITS: The denigration of our community might be an issue. I have not heard from our leadership in our community in these last Council Meetings.

MAYOR VIC COLLOVA: James, maybe I should fire him tomorrow, huh? That would probably be the right thing to do, James? It's not going to happen.

(Interruptions by other residents.)

PRESIDENT BURKE: Excuse me, Mr. Fruits. Let's wrap it up. You're way over the time limit. I have been very generous with the time.

MR. FRUITS: This is the last thing I'll say. I did call in tonight about Clmn Donahue. I want to reiterate the thing that I called in and that is that he must apologize. I'm calling and I want to know from City Council tonight what kind of training do our City Council and city leaders receive? They are elected because it does not seem to be sufficient in this case. I would like to know what kind of training Council receives and I would like to hear each Council Member and the Mayor address Clmn Donahue's actions and the things he has stated and posted. The other thing I would like to hear from the Council Members and the Mayor is a status update on our search for a new police chief. I'm asking for transparency in that to build trust with the community. Thank you.

PRESIDENT BURKE: Thank you. The only thing I would like to comment about that is I think everybody is so involved with instant gratification. We will get to the bottom of things. I would promise you that things will be handled. You just have to give it time. We have to go through the correct procedures. That's what happens in our world today is if we don't get the answer right away, people get offended. We're not here to offend anybody, but we're here to make sure that we act responsibly as a Council or as city leaders. Having said that, is there anyone else that would like to speak to Council this evening?

Michelle Stevens, 10809 Penfield Avenue. I want to address the conversation that has occurred. My name was not read on the letter, but I did sign the letter along with other names of my household. It concerns me because every time I'm on one of these calls or in any of the city meetings, etc. I'm not hearing any compassion from these leaders, especially you, Mr. Mayor. If someone tells you they're hurting, why does that anger you? Why is it funny to you? Why does it become a situation when somebody tells you that they're having a problem and they're looking to you for the answer of some help/guidance on how they can proceed and how they can have that trust back? Why does that anger you? Because as you can see these letters, violence, etc. well how do you think us as Black people experience life? A tax-paying citizen have to worry about walking out the door and not being perceived as anybody. How do you think that makes us feel? Where's your compassion? That's my concern. We're crying out to

you. We're crying out to say we need somebody to hear us, to feel our pain. Instead, you get upset and defensive and you belittle us.

MAYOR VIC COLLOVA: Can I respond?

MS. STEVENS: Yes. And our two letters prior to were not addressed. So it makes me believe again that we're not being heard.

MAYOR VIC COLLOVA: Can I address it?

PRESIDENT BURKE: Mayor Collova, you want to speak?

MAYOR VIC COLLOVA: Yes. Let me address this first thought. You are right. I do get carried away and I get upset at times when people lie or accuse me of things that are not true, but let me ask you this question in a very calm way.

MS. STEVENS: Nobody accused you of anything. Your name never came up as far as the situation with Mr. Donahue. That situation is extremely important because your protection of what's going on in this community is not being heard. You're not seeing what's going on with us. You're not listening to us so you get carried away but is not OK for us to do the same.

PRESIDENT BURKE: Excuse me, Ms. Stevens, would you please let him respond?

MAYOR VIC COLLOVA: OK. If I can respond, and I hate to respond and answer a question with a question, but when someone accuses me (of which they did) as racist, how do I respond? Do I say thank you? When I know it's totally untrue and there's many African-Americans that would be able to tell you how I really am. When I get these accusations, how do I respond? What is your suggestion? Maybe I'll follow it? What would you do?

MS. STEVENS: With compassion. I was on a Council Meeting two weeks ago and before any residents could even speak, you were highly upset with a couple residents for calling in and saying that the adjacent lawn hadn't been mowed better. Yes, you have a proper answer. Your answer should have been I'm so sorry you feel that that was something that was against you or that was racial. However, this is a community-wide issue. We are working to get to the properties. It could have been that simple to let that person know that you heard her. You feel her issue and that no, it's not a racial thing. By just being compassionate that could change the whole dynamic of how somebody feels. Because you got anger and so much so that I would never call you about anything because that was simple. That was something that you could have simply said. Hey, we're going to get to you. I promise you that we're working to get to all of our residents because we were short staffed. You explained the situation but it was anger I feel. It's that simple. If someone comes to you with something that is not truthful, you know the truth. You know every bit of the truth so you hold back on that and then show compassion to that other person because they have it wrong. But when you talk that way, you just extend it around everybody thinking well oh he's upset. Why are you upset? I don't know. I just came to you with a issue that I had that I wanted you to address.

MAYOR VIC COLLOVA: May I respond? I've talked to 25 people with problems and ask them how I respond. I do have compassion. I respond to everybody equally. I always do. But when

people fire on me, I guess I just have a hard time accepting that and saying thank you. That is a bad trait of mine so you say.

MS. STEVENS: I didn't ask you to say thank you. I never once said thank you, but you have a responsibility to your people and not take everything personally.

PRESIDENT BURKE: Would you please let him respond?

MAYOR VIC COLLOVA: I accept.

MS. STEVENS: He asked me a question. He asked me.

MAYOR VIC COLLOVA: I did.

MS. STEVENS: I missed that was a question. He asked me.

MAYOR VIC COLLOVA: And you said respond with compassion and I will certainly try to do that although I thought I'd been doing it in 99.9% of the cases, but I will try to straighten the rest of that out. Thank you for your eminence.

MS. STEVENS: Thank you, Sir. That's all I asked because when someone's hurting you can't be angered by hurt because it doesn't fix it anything. That's all I'm saying. I'm sorry if I overstepped but that's how I feel. Thank you.

PRESIDENT BURKE: Thank you, Ms. Stevens. Is there anyone else that would like to address Council?

Joyce Tubbs, 4755 Bartlett Avenue. The first thing I would like to say is we've gotten off track and gone down the rabbit hole on other issues which I'm sure are very important to some people, but we've kind of hopped around Clmn Donahue. We've talked about Clmn Donahue in some of the letters, but I would like to address the question to Clmn Donahue. Having heard what you've heard and we know before behavior there is a motivation so maybe he could speak to some of the sensitive material and insensitive religious material that was posted and the profanity. So perhaps we shouldn't keep talking around him and let him respond on his own. So Clmn Donahue, what is your response to some of the things you heard this evening?

PRESIDENT BURKE: To be fair, Ms. Tubbs, I was going to give every one of us Council people a chance to speak after the residents. If Mr. Donahue wants to address that, I'd be more than happy to let him do that at this time. Mr. Donahue, did you wish to address it now or wait till our Miscellaneous Business?

CLMN DONAHUE: I can respond now. If I get interrupted or yelled at or screamed at I'll just shut down. I won't go any further. OK? The post about men stand and b-word kneels. It wasn't towards Black men. It wasn't towards any race. It was towards football players. It wasn't about anybody praying. It was about they were kneeling during the National Anthem. I spent over 20 years in the military. I'm very proud that I spent that time so I could go out and defend this country for all of the people. White football players kneel also and I don't like that. I'm not against anybody praying/kneeling, but just do it away from the National Anthem or away from

the flag. If you don't like how it was brought up for injustice that's fine. State that. They took a post that I shared because of my feelings about somebody kneeling for the National Anthem and just blew it out of proportion.

Then there was the one about the young Black man holding the sign. I wasn't holding the sign. The Black gentleman was holding the sign. If anybody would have read the comments section I put in there that it had to have been photo shopped because I didn't feel the young man would have been that dumb to actually hold up that sign. You don't look at the other posts I put in. A video of three Black gentlemen helping a handicapped woman get in her car. I shared that post. The four gentlemen that were protecting a White police officer during one of the protests—I posted that and I made a great comment. The one of protesters who protected the police officers from a protest. I shared that and now I got people laughing. This is all about blowing out of proportion by one person who took the post and changed it the way he wanted it to be. As a matter of fact, that person gave me a thumbs up when we first shared, but then after he got a text message he changed it and he blew it all up so everybody would go against me.

I don't care what you think. I'm not a racist. You go to my neighborhood and talk to my neighbors and you ask them if I'm a racist. They will laugh in your face. You talk to the Black residents that I've helped in my Ward and they will laugh at you.

MS.TUBBS: My best friend's in your Ward.

CLMN DONAHUE: I'm sorry?

MS.TUBBS: I'm sorry. Go ahead, Mr. Donahue. You can continue.

CLMN DONAHUE: They're laughing so anything I'm saying is.

MS.TUBBS: Sir, I was not laughing. That might be from people who called that are not on mute. I have not responded to anything you said, so continue.

CLMN DONAHUE: The gentleman I was supposed to have road rage with. He says he didn't see me. I'll tell you why. He pulled around me and drove about 20 feet. Slammed on his brakes. I almost hit him. I beeped my horn and he was at the corner when I went past him. He flipped me off. I stopped, put my window down and asked him what the problem was and sped away. So I took my daughter over and dropped her off and yes I parked my car and I went over to ask him what his problem was. If I did something? He started m---f---ing me. So the badge that I was given to show that I was a Councilman I took it out and I showed it to him. I told him I was a Councilman and I wanted to know what his problem was. What did I do? He continued to m—f--- me. I never took out a gun. I never threatened him with a gun. If I would have, the police would have arrested me when they got there. I didn't even tell him I had a gun. The rent-a-cop that was there (according to him) told him I had a gun in my car and I had a gun on me. I was going to the shooting range after I dropped my daughter off. The police came, we talked and got it all straightened out.

I'm not a racist. God. Talk to me. Come see me or I will come to you and talk to you. I have no reason to be a racist. If you don't believe me, that's fine. That's your prerogative. You're doing

all of this just because somebody changed what we said. I'm sorry if it doesn't answer your question, but that's about all I got.

MS.TUBBS: Mr. Chairman, may I respond and because of the time I will keep it brief because it's very late and I know we all have responsibilities in the morning.

PRESIDENT BURKE: Yes. Go ahead.

MS.TUBBS: The fact that this picture is photo shopped, if you read the content it doesn't feel like it's the judgment and effective leadership when you post those types of things. Unfortunately, we can't see text messages and when Likes are taken back on social media. Facebook hasn't gotten that far yet. However, again, those posts are racially insensitive. There was another post about the Jehovah Witness religion, which is religiously insensitive. You reposted it, Sir. If you didn't want it to be out there you should not do that either. You have read the letter. I know that Barbara read us the first letter and there was the name there and I also added my name to that letter.

That's pretty much all I have to say. I figured that since we're all talking around you, what was your response. And I did note that instead of saying "the security guard" at Giant Eagle you said "rent-a-cop". Again, with the time we probably need to wrap things up. That's all I have. Thanks Mr. Chairman.

PRESIDENT BURKE: Thank you, Ms. Tubbs. Is there anyone else that would like to address Council?

MISCELLANEOUS BUSINESS:

PRESIDENT BURKE: If there is nobody else, we will move on to Miscellaneous Business. We will begin with Ward 1 with Clmn Dudley. Clmn Dudley, you have the floor.

CLMN DUDLEY: Well I have reposted. When I saw it I hear talk of the military, I come from a military family. Anybody see me in the city you know me because I wear my hat with my rank and insignia on it as well. I am all about military. I am all about community. I was disturbed. I had befriended him. I mean I was friends with him. I don't look at everything on Facebook every minute. If he done something was good and positive I will put a Like on there. But never put no Like on nothing like this. If we can remember, not to drag up, when we had a discussion in Council before because I was pissed off when they referred to the athletes as son of a bitches. So people know that and they know I'm processed to each his own. It is not the fact that he will put down about men stand. But I got five daughters and I feel as though as a professional he shouldn't be using that word bitches on there. I took a minute or two to scan through and see what was on there and then I unfriended him.

I think the action with the individual that happened over there in Giant Eagle was an issue. I think this here tells a like of everything. I just want to read it for a second. I read this posting by Garfield Heights Ward 2 Councilman. It's very disrespectful. To insinuate that praying before God for justice just as clergy, athletes, officials, law enforcement, families, our community are bitches. No way. All I said was they're God's children. We don't work hard. A lot of people don't work hard to bridge the gap. We been working to try to bring peace in our street. At the same time, we trying to bring peace in our street we don't need nothing like this to enflame and

start it back up. What if somebody could even have the thought to put something up there as what's going on in the world today, I mean that was just not unprofessional to my opinion. It's pure racist.

I don't believe ever that I will have the same ability to want to sit beside him on Council let alone work with him. I don't believe honestly that Mr. Donahue would serve in the best interest of the people in the Ward collectively in this city. Not at all. It's for the betterment of the city because of the lack of trust. I'm not talking about the people the lack of trust I have for him to serve in the best interest of the people in my community because we like a kingdom almost. We are collectively in a Ward that we passed for the betterment of the city of Garfield Heights. I don't believe it would serve in the best interest of our community of Ward 1. You got to hear my voice. We been having this all night here, but it wouldn't serve in the best interests. To Mr. Fruits, I wanted to throw that out there too.

Also nobody has a clue what I work on. Trust me, I be in meetings. I never stop working. I never stop working on this issue here because that hurt me and hurt me so bad. I'm a person who is known as the individual probably on Council been hurt from starting. I didn't go for racism in the military and I been called nigger, etc. coming up. I haven't had a job since I been out of the service, even the politics, that I didn't deal with some type of racism. But if you know me, you talk to me, you'd never believe that. Anybody on Council, including him, know that if I had a problem with you one day, the next day I'm having a conversation with the Members of Council from Garfield. I don't carry it over to the next day.

This right here was absolutely unacceptable. I have never cared anything. I never been this angry about anything that really happened on Garfield Heights City Council. I don't believe that we would not say something if we wasn't in the process of thinking about doing something. I don't believe that actions would change. I don't believe if we going to say something or do something that a month or two months down the road he going to go back because he going to think it's OK. Personally, I think it's in the best interest and it's not because of anybody's wishes, but it's my opinion that he needs to step down. He needs to step down from Council or somebody needs to take action because he's not going to change. When I looked at his page and saw that, I said wow. It just blew over my head. I got photocopies of some of the stuff they were going to say. Right then and there I unfriended him and that's when I put my message. This is not something that happens one day. This is an ongoing repeated process. Some stuff he has is not to go outside the city that you hear which is derogatory coming down from other States maybe and has been re-posted. You can't help but know this is going to hurt people, especially Black people. Because all White people are not racist. A lot of them are hurt. They got their heads busted up in the protests. They got kick-ass out there. It was Hispanics, Asian-Americans, everybody was protesting that he got hurt—not just the Blacks. People want change. People want peace. I don't categorize everybody as being racist just because they White or any other. I don't want them to category me as a racist because I'm a Black person. But Mr. Donahue, I don't care to serve with you no more. I don't care to have you represent a part of the body of Garfield Heights. I don't think from what I heard from residents from Ward 2, etc. and the e-mails. I won't repeat them. I think you doing yourself a favor.

I think you should step down and go look somewhere else and do your thing. I don't want to beat nobody else up on Council because they decisions is they decision. But if I had the opportunity to vote to remove you, I will vote to remove you from office, Mr. Donahue. You

have given us a bad name. You look at that oath that you signed when you got sworn in. Mine is up on the fireplace. You should take a look at it. Go read it carefully and tell me honestly that you followed that oath all the way up until this time. It is absolutely unacceptable. I wish you will do the honorary thing as one military person to another. My Dad is a retired military, my brother he paid the ultimate price protecting our family. You need to step down, Mr. Donahue. That's all I have, Mr. Chairman. Thank you.

PRESIDENT BURKE: Thank you, Mr. Dudley. Mr. Donahue, you're up.

CLMN DONAHUE: I guess that whatever I said when I gave my little speech, everything was going to fall on deaf ears. There's no way I'm going to step down because I did nothing wrong. You changed the post, Mr. Dudley. You changed it. I said it was about football players kneeling. You changed it to Black men, racial, that were praying. That's what the post was. I'm not going to keep repeating myself because people were not going to listen to what I have to say. That's all I have.

PRESIDENT BURKE: Thank you, Mr. Donahue. Mr. Nenadovich.

CLMN NENADOVICH: Yes, Mr. Chairman. I do have a comment to make. I have a question for Mr. Donahue to start this thing off. At any time, Mr. Donahue, did you brandish or show the person you had the altercation with (allegedly) show a gun to that person?

CLMN DONAHUE: No. I never showed him my gun. I never told him I had a gun. He did not find out until that auxiliary police officer went over there and told him I had two guns.

CLMN NENADOVICH: OK. That's what I wanted to clarify because I had talked to you and he did say this and I figured I would go to you and talk to you before I even asked this question. This wasn't pre-planned. This was on the spur of the moment. I saw you the other day. Thank you, Mr. Donahue.

The next thing I want to go by is about Chuck leaving office and being I encourage Mr. Donahue, like the Mayor says, the people put you in, let the people take you out. That's the way it's supposed to be. You are an elected official. Council does have that power, but the electors have the final say.

Also, in the letters that were read, one letter said that I am behind the police 100%. I am. I am behind the police 100%, but any officer that does not abide by the law, I will be 100% for taking actions to remove him from his job. Until proven guilty, that officer is innocent, just as the alleged criminal is innocent until proven guilty. Oh God, here we go. There's comments by citizens again. I hear that. All of Council, like the Mayor says, was there and going back to the statement where I had backed the Mayor, yes, I do back the Mayor. I have to back the Mayor because I believe in what he said is right. If he's wrong, I will argue with him. I don't just vote Yes because I'm a Councilman and I want to please Vic. I vote Yes on what I feel is right. I do have disagreements with Mr. Collova. But by the same token, I'm there to support him in all his right decisions and I don't think he's made any bad ones yet. That's my opinion.

In response to my constituents, however, I represent all of my constituents equally. You can call my Ward and find out if you have a problem nine times out of 10 I knock on your door. I

don't like to talk on the phone. I do answer my calls, but all my constituents are represented. Constituents in my Ward, if they have a problem, call me. A lot of times they don't like the answer I give them, but I also have to obey the law. I have to obey the ordinances of the city. I have to obey the ordinances and rules of the State and the country. I have to obey those rules. And if they disagree with what you think your neighbors should do, I think it's time for you and your neighbor to sit down because we're not here to cure all problems. We're here to let you know what the consequences are if you don't want to abide by the ordinances. Also what your rights are by the ordinances. Some people, like I said, don't like my answers, but this is what I'm telling them.

As far as equal rights, in my opinion, the biggest thing that we have going for us is people and I've been accused of missing the word equal as a coded word. I don't know what else to call people. I don't want to call them animals, etc. I'm used to calling people people. I think our biggest problem is when we say Black people, White people, Red people. That's our biggest problem. We have to start thinking of people as people. I've been doing that my whole life because I have grown up in both neighborhoods. I'm a product of 78th and Aetna. So you know where I came from.

And one of my good friends and also who is a good friend of another Councilman, former Chief Sackett. He was against this flag kneeling and he says, his quote, "We have 23 hours and 58 minutes to pray. The National Anthem is two minutes long. We stand." That's from Chief Sackett. Him and I never saw eye to eye too much, but Mr. Sackett, I still like him as a friend.

Last but not least, again, we're judging him before his trial. We can't do that to the criminal. We got to hear both sides of the story. And as both sides of the story go, it's still in litigation. People don't want to hear that, but that's the truth. Even if the officer is proven innocent, he could sue us. You know, it's a catch-22. We have to be right in what we say.

Again, I will stand by Mr. Donahue and let the people decide what is right. Six people on Council will not make that decision, I don't believe. Let the people make that decision. Thank you. That's all I have to say, Mr. Chairman.

PRESIDENT BURKE: Thank you, Mr. Nenadovich. Ms. Davis.

CLWN DAVIS: Thank you, Mr. Chairman. The first thing I would like to respond to is Mr. Donahue's statements that were brought to my attention. Mr. Donahue and I are not friends on Facebook. I believe he has me blocked because I was not able to see anything. People started sending me statements and I posted in response to Clmn Dudley and to other residents openly and clearly. I denounce the accusations behind those posts. The one most offensive to me was the one of the young Black man standing there. I am the mother of a Black son who at the community prayer event I kind of spoke about my fear. My son doesn't have to feel he could get into any kind of trouble. He's a 22-year old in college. However, I worry about his life every day. Clearly, you can tell that that was photo shopped, but during this time, I think it is the most inappropriate time to post something like that.

As Mayor Collova has stated, he is very upset and angry because he's getting all these calls and e-mails and different things about the race tensions in the community. We held, two weeks ago a community conversation on race. The reason for that conversation was a follow up to the

prayer event to figure out how to bring us together collectively. The duty of the community does not lie solely on the legislators, the Administration, the residents, or the police. It's the responsibility of everyone to care enough to step outside of ourselves and look at the entire community. We all have a duty to do better. There is no one on this phone call that is perfect. I will be the first to profess I fail probably every single day. But taking responsibility for something I have done if I have wronged someone is extremely important. As a leader, we do have a duty and responsibility to publicly stand up and ethically do what is right. It is not my duty or responsibility to ask Mr. Donahue to step down so I will not do that, but I will ask him, Mr. Donahue, with everything that you said, please take some time to think about what people said to you and how it made them feel. If you can find it in your heart to think about that and consider them, would you apologize? I have apologized to people many times that I did not intentionally set out to offend. You have offended me. You have offended who I am and what I represent.

Whether it was intentional or not, I will also say to the residents of Ward 2 or this community, you have a right through our Charter to request a recall. If that is what you feel needs to happen, then do the due diligence based off of the letters that were received. That is the direction that you guys will go. You have the right to do so.

When I was elected, I said that I was there for the community. My goal from the day I walked in this office was to bridge the gap and to try to bring our community together. I do not have all the answers but I have tried and I will continue to try. I do not appreciate or believe that divisiveness will ever get us to a place of power, hope or a better position in this community. It is time that each and every one of us stand up and realize that Garfield Heights has issues that we need to collectively figure out how to address. It's going to take some time and it is going to be painful. We need to do it. We deserve to live in this community, every one of us, Black or White. And yes, we are Black or White because that is the label that America has historically placed on us. I will not deny myself for that or anyone else. At this point in time, I am looking for resolve.

I stand before you as a Member of Council and a resident in this community and I am requesting that we as Council leadership schedule a meeting to talk about some sort of social competency and/or implicit bias training. We need to serve our community with our whole heart and some level of understanding. I do not believe that we are all doing that, not because someone is a bad person. That's not my duty or responsibility to figure that out, but because that opportunity has not been presented. Now is the time. I am listening to our community. We must do something different. We have an opportunity in Garfield Heights to set a tone that other communities have not. We will take the steps to try to figure out what needs to be done. What do we want to do from attempting to do a little better? That issue, I have nothing else to say about that.

What I'd also like to mention that we need to figure out how to set up Zoom meetings. These telephone calls where no one seems to get through. There's a lot of unintentional things that happen that are inappropriate. People laughing, people speaking up and it's disrespectful and it does not bring order to us as a leadership. We've got to figure it out. Yes, I am the Chair of Communications and Technology. I have tried to address this issue, but we need to figure it out and by our next meeting, I would hope that we are able to move forward with technology. I do not believe that Covid is going away soon. If so, we're going to be at a distance for an

extended amount of time. We need a better way to be able to effectively communicate and get through these meetings respectfully. To Council President Burke, I believe you do a great job at maintaining order. So this has not to do with you. It is difficult to do over the phone.

Also I would like to let you guys know that on Saturday, July 18th, myself, School Board Member Nichelle Daniels, School Board Member Millette Tucker are hosting a Garfield Heights Civic Engagement event where we are going to have people come. It's a drive-up event. Complete their absentee ballot applications for the November election.

If anyone does recall back in March I did a census competition with Maple Heights. We won that competition by like .26%. However I looked at the numbers today. Garfield Heights has only completed the Census by 62.2%. So when I talk about things like implicit bias training and everyone talks about some of the issues that they have, the community needs to understand if we don't have the money, programs and services that could be greatly beneficial to us and our needs cannot be developed, created or established. Please complete your Census. We have until August 1st. If we don't complete at a 100% rate and we remain at 62% we'll get 62% of the money to cover 100% of the community. Now that is not fair. Additionally we will have Joe Biden yard signs there for people to pick up.

I have a new business that opened up called Apple Spice. It's a catering company that does corporate lunches. They opened up on February 24, 2020, and about 2.5 weeks later Covid hit. The business was shut down. They have since reopened. They did provide some of the snacks that we had at the community conversation on race. I appreciate them for that. That will be owner Mark Andrew. I spoke to him about hiring residents locally. I'm very happy to report that there's one job created. It's only one but ... I posted it on my social media. A resident reached out and applied. Mark called me this morning to tell me he hired the resident. I'm not clear on which Ward they live in yet but it's either Ward 4 or Ward 3. I'm very excited about that. I want more businesses to come and be intentional about our community. With that, Mr. Chairman, I am done.

PRESIDENT BURKE: Thank you, Clwn Davis. Clmn Blake, you're up.

CLMN BLAKE: Thank you, Mr. Chairman. I'd like to start by talking about the social media post as all my colleagues have done to this point. I want to be clear as a resident and a Member of our City Council, I believe the posts shared on social media are in poor taste and they are embarrassing to me. As an elected official, we need to strive for a standard of conduct, leadership and civility in our community. Our professional conduct in the sense of positive community relations now more than ever we should want to uplift our community as a result of current events in our country as well as our community. I stand by these statements and I remind myself of that belief theory. As a community, we've taken some steps forward with meaningful community discussions regarding race relations that are Holy Spirit in The Rock Church in the recent past. But in my opinion, the postings that were made cause us to take steps backward. It is apparent by the comments of the residents who have spoken here today as well as to keep communication to Council. Our community leadership and residents must be trustful of each other to move this community forward. Without trust, this is never going to happen.

I ask Clmn Donahue, I ask my colleagues how are we going to move forward from this occurrence. One of the ways I believe we can do that, Clwn Davis had mentioned, is specific training for Members of Council to help prevent reoccurrences like this from happening again. Again, I am not going to ask Clmn Donahue to resign, but I will state that it is up to the residents of Ward 2 to come to the understanding that they would like Clmn Donahue to represent them moving into the future.

Moving on from the negative in the social media posts, I want to point out a few residents that have taken some positive roles in the community and ran with a program that I got involved with. I literally have no idea what I'm doing. That is the Community Garden at Hy Court. I want to commend Ms. Donna Bell, Ms. Jeanine Jazerbowski and Dina Gilbert for the job they've done taking care of the garden at Hy Court. There are personal plots up there for residents to use, but the main goal of that community garden up there will be to donate food to the food shelter for the city. Again, they have done an outstanding job and I just wanted to commend them.

I want to end on a positive note, after talking about the negativity for the last few hours, the last thing I will say, as a Councilman in Ward 5, if any resident that needs to talk to me, I have done my best to treat every resident respectfully and courteously in whatever endeavor I take. If you need to contact me, my number is on the City Council page for the city of Garfield Heights. I will gladly take your call and work with you in any way I can. With that, that's all I have.

PRESIDENT BURKE: Thank you, Mr. Blake. First, I'd like to say thank you to everyone that's supported my family and me with the tragic loss of my granddaughter Eleanor. Your prayers and kind words have really helped to get us through the tragic loss. I got to tell you that Clwn Davis had called me and she took the time to pray with me over the phone. I can't tell you how special that made me feel, how great that made me feel. Our lives will never be the same as a family. On behalf of my son and my daughter-in-law, I would like to say thank you for everything.

As far as Mr. Donahue and the posts, I think they were just a very, very bad choice of judgment. I don't know what else to say in regards to that. I think with everything going on in our community today, I just think that it's very, very with the sensitivity of everything going on, to post something like that, I would think you would use better judgment.

Seven years ago, when I was elected to Council I realized how my life had changed. I came to a realization that being an elected official meant that I had great responsibility to my constituents along with taking that responsibility very seriously. I'd like to tell you what that responsibility means to me. It means that I should always do the right thing, fiscally in-house, district, do the right thing for people. I should always try my best as a Councilman and most of all, I should always show my constituents that I care about their concerns. If a neighbor has a need or concern, I do my best to resolve the situation or get them the help that they need to address their concerns.

But over the past few months, I have witnessed the behavior of some of my colleagues that have left me speechless. I am concerned with the division in Council. Are we really working for our constituents? Are we working to make our community a better place? Are we bringing the community together or are we turning people against one another? Are we confusing what is

going on nationally with what's going on here in our city? Are we pushing our own political agendas or our careers? Are we trying our best to do the right things that the residents care about? If not, then we just need to move on and let somebody else be the representatives.

One of my neighbors, Joe Kubacha, who lives on Granger Road down the street from me, sent me this text the other day, "Just wanted to say this is a nice Ward. For years, I used to jog around, walking a lot of times after 11:00 p.m. and there was never a problem. Thanks to cancer, I no longer need to lose weight, but I still walk the dog around and it's a very nice place to live." I got to tell you. That made my night, especially over these last few weeks. I have worked hard over the last seven years for my constituents and we have made Ward 6 "a nice place to live". But we did it together and I'm very proud of that accomplishment. The residents know that when they call me, they're going to get a respectful response from me. I do my best to address their every concern, even if it's not pleasant, but it's what I do as their Council representative. I do it because Garfield Heights deserves that from me as their representative and they will always get my best effort. I'll always carry myself as someone that they can be proud of.

But I got to tell you with my recent family tragedy and my personal professional opportunities that are being offered to me, I am considering not running for any future political office once this term is up. After all, I did say I would serve as a Member of City Council for a total of eight years. However, our Council is currently divided and all of you need to ask yourselves, am I doing the right things? Am I working hard for my neighbors? Do I care enough about them to always represent them with the respect they deserve as some of the highest taxpayers in the County? I can only hope that all of us can find a way to work together for our community. That's all I have.

Our next Council Meeting will be on August 10th and we will be doing it via Zoom. I am working on that pretty much every day with Judge Nicastro. Ms. Davis, I could use your help on that a lot, and I will be calling you for your help on that.

At this time, I'd like to make a motion that we adjourn the Meeting. Will the Clerk please take a roll call vote, beginning with Clmn Dudley.

AYES: Dudley, Donahue, Nenadovich, Davis, Blake, Burke

ABSENT: Vaughn

Let the record show that by 6 votes the Meeting stands adjourned at 9:46 p.m. Thank you everybody for your professionalism.

MEETING ADJOURNED AT 9:46 p.m.

APPROVED:

RESPECTFULLY SUBMITTED:

Matthew Burke
President of Council

Barbara Molin
Clerk of Council